Coffee certification in East Africa
Coffee certification in East Africa
Impact on farms, families and cooperatives

edited by:
Ruerd Ruben
Paul Hoebink
Preface

Certification of coffee producers is frequently advocated as a key strategy for reinforcing farmers’ livelihoods and for strengthening smallholder integration into sustainable supply chain management. The credibility of these claims has been scarcely documented and field evidence on real welfare effects and changes in bargaining power is notable absent.

This collection of empirical field studies provides new and unique insights into the impact of coffee certification in East African countries, based on a thorough combination of extensive farm-household and cooperative survey data with in-depth interviews with male and female farmers, their families, village and community focus groups and cooperative authorities. All papers rely on a careful combination of quantitative and qualitative field data and thus represent a balanced mixed-methods approach that enables a better understanding of the dynamic effects and the long-term implications of coffee labelling.

This collection of article includes three types of studies. First, we present a set of three country studies on the effects of certification on farm-household welfare and cooperative organisation in Uganda, Kenya and Ethiopia. These studies are based on unique longitudinal survey data collected in 2009 and 2012 from a balanced sample of certified coffee farmers and a non-certified control group in order to be able to identify the net impact of certification. The field study in Ethiopia focuses particularly on the effects of multi-certification. Together, these studies represent a follow-up to our earlier study on ‘The impact of Fair Trade’ (edited by Ruerd Ruben) that was published in 2008 by Wageningen Academic Publishers.

The second part of the book includes two detailed studies regarding the effects of coffee certification on the internal organisation and operational performance at the cooperative level. Due attention is given to the changes in risk behaviour and market outlet choice that are associated with coffee labelling in Kenya, and the effects of certification on farmers’ willingness to invest, engagement into collective action and mutual trust in different types of coffee cooperatives in Ethiopia. The third part of the book focuses on changes in intra-household relationships due to coffee certification. Implications for gender equity in Kenya and for women’s bargaining position and trust in Ethiopian coffee cooperatives are discussed against the background of the debates on sustainable livelihoods and gender in development policies.

The editors gratefully acknowledge the cooperation in field research in Kenya by Mzeeh Hamisi Ngutu, Urbanus N. Mutwiwa and Samuel Njuguna of Noble Consultants Company Ltd., and in Uganda by Fred Bagamba from the Department of Agribusiness and Resource Economics at Makerere University. Field research in Ethiopia has been directed by Amsaya Anteneh Woubie. The first round of data collection in Kenya and Ethiopia has been coordinated by prof. Ruerd Ruben, while the second round was
coordinated by prof. Paul Hoebink, Bart van Rijsbergen en Willem Elbers. Mirjam Schoonhoven-Speijer and Eveline Dijkdreth contributed in-depth studies on coffee cooperatives in Kenya, and Christine Plaisier and Annemarie Groot Kormelinck conducted field work in the context of the Ethiopian coffee cooperatives. Funding for the fieldwork in Kenya and Uganda has been provided by Irish Aid through the Solidaridad programme ‘Building trade Capacity and Sustainable Livelihoods through Fair Trade and Ethical trade’, while the field work in Ethiopia has been supported by the Dutch Science Foundation (NWO-WOTRO) under the ‘Cooperatives & Chains’ research program. Editorial assistance by Renate Smallegange of Wageningen Academic Publishers is gratefully acknowledged.

Nijmegen/The Hague, August 2014

Paul Hoebink & Ruerd Ruben, editors
3.8 Conclusions 114
References 116
Annex 117

Chapter 4
Impact of multiple certification on smallholder coffee farmers’ livelihoods: evidence from southern Ethiopia 127
Amsaya Anteneh Woubie, Roldan Muradian and Ruerd Ruben
4.1 Introduction 127
4.2 Coffee production and exchange in Ethiopia 130
4.3 Impact of multi-certification 131
4.4 Data and approach 133
4.5 Measuring the impact of double and triple certification on coffee farmers’ livelihood 134
4.6 Results 135
4.7 Discussion and implications 141
References 144

Chapter 5
Maintaining sustainable livelihoods: effects of Utz certification on market access, risk reduction and livelihood strategies of Kenyan coffee farmers 149
Mirjam Schoonhoven-Speijer and Ruerd Ruben
5.1 Introduction 149
5.2 Theoretical framework and hypotheses 150
5.3 Materials and methods 153
5.4 Results 157
5.5 Discussion 165
5.6 Outlook: new insights and remaining questions 167
References 168
Annex 171

Chapter 6
Blessing of the bean or curse of the cooperative? – willingness to invest and trust of farmers in coffee cooperatives of Ethiopia 175
Christine Plaisier
6.1 Introduction 175
6.2 Theoretical framework 176
6.3 Research context 179
6.4 Operationalisation of main concepts 180
6.5 Research methods 182
6.6 Results 186
6.7 Loyalty, trust and investments 193
6.8 Conclusions and outlook 197
References 201
Annex 204
Chapter 7
Gender equity within Utz certified coffee cooperatives in Eastern Province, Kenya

Eveline Dijkdrenth

7.1 Introduction
7.2 Gender equity
7.3 Analytical framework
7.4 Materials and methods
7.5 Gender development at cooperative level
7.6 Gender relations at household level
7.7 Gender interactions between the cooperative field and the household field
7.8 Conclusions

References

Chapter 8
Back to the birthplace of the bean: women’s bargaining position and trust in Ethiopian coffee cooperatives

Annemarie Groot Kormelinck

8.1 Introduction
8.2 Conceptual framework
8.3 Ethiopian context
8.4 Research methods
8.5 Results
8.6 Discussion
8.7 Conclusions

References

Annex

About the authors
List of figures

Chapter 1
Figure 1.1. Price ratio between coffee and other crops in Kenya

Chapter 2
Figure 2.1. Uganda coffee export production trends (2000-2009).

Chapter 3
Figure 3.1. Kenya coffee producing areas and location of case studies.
Figure 3.2. Area under coffee bushes in Kenya (2006/2007 to 2010/2011).
Figure 3.3. Total coffee production in Kenya (2006/2007 to 2010/2011).
Figure 3.4. Average yields from estates and cooperatives (2006/2007 to 2010/2011).
Figure 3.5. Volume of coffee sold via direct sales (2010/2011 coffee year).
Figure 3.6. Quantity of different grades auctioned (2000/2001 to 2010/2011).
Figure 3.7. Average price of main grades auctioned (2000/2001 to 2010/2011).
Figure 3.8. Value of different grades auctioned between 2000/2001 and 2010/2011.
Figure 3.9. Average price per 50 kg bag of coffee (2010/2011).
Figure 3.10. Relative price differences between Kiambu and Nyeri districts.
Figure A.1. Distribution of propensity scores before and after matching

Chapter 4
Figure 4.1. Propensity score distribution for double certification (Fair Trade + organic).
Figure 4.2. Propensity score distribution for triple certification (Fair Trade + organic + Utz).

Chapter 6
Figure 6.1. Methodological outline of the field research.

Chapter 7
Figure 7.1. Interrelated dimensions of choice.
Figure 7.2. Gender composition of (A) shareholders, (B) active at cooperative meetings and voting, and (C) that are eligible at elections for Rianjagi and Kithungururu cooperatives in 2009/2010. Absolute numbers are given in parentheses.

Chapter 8
Figure 8.1. Location of cooperatives in Sidama region, Ethiopia.
List of tables

**Chapter 1**
Table 1.1. Proliferation of coffee labels. 28
Table 1.2. Impact evaluations of Fair Trade coffee schemes. 37
Table 1.3. Stylised results from coffee impact studies. 40

**Chapter 2**
Table 2.1. Number of farmers included in the Uganda case study. 54
Table 2.2. Sample composition by degree and years of certification (2009-2012). 55
Table 2.3. Impact evaluation strategy in Ibanda district. 61
Table 2.4. Impact of Utz certification (Old Ankole versus New Ankole farmers). 62
Table 2.5. Impact of Utz certification (Old Ankole versus conventional farmers). 64
Table 2.6. Impact of Utz certification (New Ankole versus conventional farmers). 65
Table 2.7. Impact evaluation strategy in Kamuli district. 71
Table 2.8. Impact of Utz certification (Kulika 1 versus Mbulamuti farmers). 72
Table 2.9. Impact of Utz certification (Kulika 2 versus Nawanyaru farmers). 74
Table 2.10. Month of coffee buying in Uganda. 77
Table 2.11. Utz certified farmers in Uganda (2007-2011). 78

**Chapter 3**
Table 3.1. Sample composition: number of farmers included in study. 84
Table 3.2. Fair Trade and Utz certification of the cooperatives in the study (data for the impact analysis was collected in 2009 and 2013). 85
Table 3.3. Area under coffee production and production in Kenya (estimates for 2008-2012). 87
Table 3.4. Yield of main coffee varieties grown in Kenya. 88
Table 3.5. Quantity of Kenyan coffee sold through the auction and direct sales (2006/2007 to 2011/2012). 93
Table 3.6. Average prices for main coffee grades (2008-2009 to 2011-2012; in USD). 96
Table 3.7. Value of purchased agricultural inputs (excluding labour) in KSh millions. 97
Table 3.8. Difference in difference – Kiambaa (FT) versus Mikari (control). 99
Table 3.9. Difference in difference – Rugi (FT) versus Kiama (control). 100
Table 3.10. Difference in difference – Tekangu (Utz) versus Kiama (control). 101
Table 3.11. Difference in difference – Tekangu (Utz) versus Rugi (FT). 102
Table 3.12. Awareness of Fair Trade (FT) or Utz certification (percentage of interviewed cooperative members who answered positively). 103
Table 3.13. Income from coffee as percentage of total income. 104
Table A.1. Summary of the impact of coffee certification, Kenya. 117
Table A.2. Descriptive statistics of studied farms in the Kiambu district. 119
Table A.3. Descriptive statistics of studied farms in the Nyeri district. 121
Table A.4. General information on Kiambu and Nyeri districts 123
Table A.5. Probit models after matching 124

Chapter 4
Table 4.1. Number of cases and sample size by certification type of coffee cooperatives under the Sidama Union. 134
Table 4.2. Description of variables and summary statistics. 136
Table 4.3. Percentage of respondents from cooperatives with awareness on certification. 137
Table 4.4. Probit estimates and marginal effects of participation in double-certification (Fair Trade and organic). 138
Table 4.5. Probit estimates and marginal effects of participation in triple-certification (Fair Trade, organic and Utz). 139
Table 4.6. Comparison of Fair Trade/organic (double) versus only Fair Trade certified coffee farmers using various matching methods. 140
Table 4.7. Comparison of Fair Trade/Organic/Utz (triple) versus only Fair Trade certified coffee farmers using various matching methods. 141

Chapter 5
Table 5.1. Overview of production and payments of four cooperatives (2009-2010 season). 154
Table 5.2. Probability of becoming Utz certified (Model 1 – logistic regression). 156
Table 5.3. Descriptive characteristics of coffee production and risk attitudes. 158
Table 5.4. Trust in cooperative and loyalty towards cooperative (Model 2 – OLS regression). 161
Table 5.5. Explaining risk perceptions, Embu district (Model 3 – 2SLS regression). 163
Table 5.6. Explaining risk perceptions, Mathioya district (Model 4 – 2SLS regression). 164
Table 5.7. Overview of hypotheses and outcomes. 165
Table A.1. Risk categories 171

Chapter 6
Table 6.1. Cooperative performance: perceptions, problems and degree of satisfaction. 186
Table 6.2. Outcomes from trust data survey. 187
Table 6.3. Outcomes from trust game. 187
Table 6.4. Institutional trust (OLS regression). Production function of institutional trust by cooperative performance. 188
Table 6.5. Engagement with cooperative affairs. 191
Table 6.6. Motives for investment in cooperatives. 193
Table 6.7. Members willingness for collective action (VCM game). 194
Table 6.8. Factors explaining loyalty, participation/commitment and investments in cooperatives. 196
Table A.1. Descriptive statistics 204
Chapter 7
Table 7.2. Composition of the sample of farmers. 216
Table 7.3. Requirements for participating during meetings and election in the management committee at Rianjagi and Kithungururu (in kg cherries). 219
Table 7.4. Perceptions on women’s leadership by male and female respondents (n=24, Rianjagi and n=28, Kithungururu). 224

Chapter 8
Table 8.1. Overview of respondents by cooperative and by gender. 241
Table 8.2. Descriptive statistics on bargaining relations in the household. 242
Table 8.3. Descriptive statistics of the survey and experiments. 245
Table A.1. Descriptive statistics: comparing gender bargaining gaps within and between low- and high-performing cooperatives. 257
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2SLS</td>
<td>2-stage least squares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APEP</td>
<td>Agricultural Production Enhancement Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATT</td>
<td>Average treatment effect on the treated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>Cronbach’s alpha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMB</td>
<td>Coffee marketing board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>Coffee berry disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIDIN</td>
<td>Centre on International Development Issues Nijmegen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETB</td>
<td>Ethiopian Birr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECX</td>
<td>Ethiopia Commodity Exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus group discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLO</td>
<td>Fair Trade Labelling Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FT</td>
<td>Fair Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAD</td>
<td>Gender and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAP</td>
<td>Good Agricultural Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPP</td>
<td>Good Processing Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFOAM</td>
<td>International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISEAL</td>
<td>International Social and Environmental Accreditation and Labelling (alliance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KSh</td>
<td>Kenyan shilling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NC</td>
<td>Non-certified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLS</td>
<td>Ordinary least square</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PO</td>
<td>Producer organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSM</td>
<td>Propensity score matching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFA</td>
<td>Rainforest Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCFCU</td>
<td>Sidama Coffee Farmers Cooperative Union (Ethiopia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL</td>
<td>Sustainable livelihoods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCDA</td>
<td>Uganda Coffee Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UGX</td>
<td>Ugandan shilling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USD</td>
<td>US dollar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utz</td>
<td>Utz certified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCM</td>
<td>Voluntary contribution mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WID</td>
<td>Women in Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>